

MEMORANDUM

DATE: May 27, 2004
TO: Absentees of the 5/21/04 Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting
FROM: Michael Murray, Advisory Council Coordinator
RE: **May 21st SAC meeting highlights and handouts**

The May 21st meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council was an informative and important Council session. For your review, please read the following bullet-point list of highlights from the meeting. Additional details will be provided to you soon via the draft meeting notes. Handout materials provided at the meeting are enclosed.

Administrative Business and Announcements

- SAC attendance was good, with 17 of 20 voting seats represented. Voting seats absent for the day were Commercial Fishing, California Resources Agency, and Ventura County. Public attendance peaked at approximately fifteen individuals.
- New Council members were announced: Jim Knowlton (public at-large alternate) and Tonya Ramsey (National Marine Fisheries Service alternate).
- New Council vacancies were announced: tourism member, public at-large member, research member, commercial fishing alternate. Applications accepted until June 20 and available on line: <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/sacnews.html>
- Outgoing SAC member Robert Duncan (Public At-Large member) was acknowledged for his service on the Council and presented with a framed CINMS poster and mounted plaque.
- January and March 2004 draft meeting notes were adopted as final.
- During the Manager's Report, Chris Mobley talked briefly about several research and education highlights that appear in the report, and also announced that:
 - Sean Hastings is on paternity leave following the May 8th birth of his son Finlay Osler Hastings
 - Lt. Commander Andrea Hruzovsky has rotated out of CINMS, and Julie Helmers (also with the NOAA Corps) has arrived as the new Executive Officer and pilot.
- Sarah MacWilliams explained that the Draft Management Plan and associated Draft Environmental Impact Statement are still under review at NOAA. Clearance for public release is expected this summer.
- Mike Murray announced that the CINMS Biogeography Study is nearing completion, and explained what the study is about. Details are on line here: http://biogeo.nos.noaa.gov/projects/assess/ca_nms/cinms/
- Council Member Announcements:
 - Michael Hanrahan reported that the first annual Santa Barbara Ocean Film Festival was held on May 19 and was a huge success, filling UCSB's Campbell Hall.
 - Russell Galipeau acknowledged David Begun has been selected as the National Park Service (NPS) Pacific West Region recipient of the George B. Hartzog, Jr. award for Outstanding Volunteer Service. David spends 365 days per year on Santa Rosa Island. Russell also

- announced that Glacier Bay Tours is looking for opportunities to expand their operations in the Sanctuary and Park in 2006. Russell described them as a high-end scale operation usually carrying 60-70 passengers and planning to operate out of Long Beach.
- Craig Taylor announced that the latest edition of the Marine Technology Society's journal focuses on marine acoustics, featuring broad based and specific articles on the subject. Craig also announced that he is on board of the Marine Conservation Research Institute at the Aquarium of the Pacific in Long Beach, and that they are hosting a symposium in the first week of June focused on bringing together national experts (see <http://www.aquariumofpacific.org/MCRI/index.html> for more information).
 - Robert Duncan reported that the Santa Barbara Maritime Museum recently hosted a visit by over 400 school kids.
 - Bob Warner shared news that the Pacific Fishery Management Council's Science and Statistical Committee had recently issued a draft white paper on procedures for reviewing proposals for marine reserves. Public comments are being taken, and a copy of the paper can be obtained from Bob (warner@lifesci.ucsb.edu).
 - Monica Baker announced that the Channel Islands National Park is putting on an underwater video program every Tuesday and Thursday at Anacapa Island, and that Island Packers has been seeing humpback whales lately around Anacapa and Santa Cruz islands.
 - Greg Helms announced that there will be a June 7-9 "Consensus Conference on Integrating Marine Reserve Science and Fishery Management" hosted by the National Fisheries Conservation Center, held in Long Beach, and aimed at addressing synthesis of marine ecological research with fishery management research and science. Details are on line here: <http://www.nfcc-fisheries.org/>.
 - Barbara LaCorte commented that humpbacks are in Sanctuary now and everyone should get out there. She also mentioned that CINC naturalists are taking pictures of flukes and dorsal fins for photo ID for John Calambokidis.
 - Chris Mobley introduced Susan Sember. Susan is President of The Essential Image Source Foundation. The non-profit Foundation has begun work on production of a high definition "docufeature" film for the Sanctuary and National Park, as well as an image library. The project's working title is "Jewels of the Pacific: the Channel Islands." Support, contributions and offers to help have been streaming in. More assistance with boat access to the islands is still needed. Additional information is available from Susan at 805-969-9010 or at www.incameraproductions.org.

Working Group Reports

- **Conservation Working Group:** Greg Helms summarized the results of the group's meeting on March 18, noting that interns Shiva Polefka and Sara Polgar are helping to research the issue of marine acoustics/noise impacts and Sanctuary water quality issues. Reports on both of those issues are forthcoming, and will be provided to the SAC.
- **Recreational Fishing Working Group:** Merit McCrea briefly summarized joint meetings held on May 11 and May 18 between the Recreational and Commercial fishing working groups. Merit explained that at the first meeting a very helpful overview presentation was provided to the working group by Chris Mobley, and that he (Merit) had also provided recreational fishermen with a simple presentation about how marine reserves work and distributed a survey to help him gauge where his constituents were at with respect to marine reserves and Sanctuary involvement. Merit did not have time to present the survey results, but they are available from him (meritmccrea@hotmail.com). Merit also mentioned that at the second joint recreational/commercial fishing working group meeting on May 18th, a smaller group of fishermen worked together on a marine reserve and conservation area mapping proposal that they wish to

submit for consideration as an alternative in the forthcoming DEIS on federal marine protected areas within CINMS.

- **Commercial Fishing Working Group:** Chris Miller (filling in for Harry Liquornik) commented that he felt it was a positive step that the commercial and recreational fishermen had been meeting jointly, and he appreciated the time Chris Mobley has been taking to work with them. He explained that the mapping proposal being worked on by members from the two working groups was taking a habitat coverage approach, and with consideration to a sustainable fisheries goal had resulted in extending proposed closure areas southward beyond Gull Island and the CINMS boundary. Chris Miller also commented that he felt the PFMC Science and Statistical Committee's (SSC's) white paper on marine reserves would be helpful for resolving some of the lingering issues associated with the CINMS process.
- **Sanctuary Education Team (SET):** Craig Taylor reported that the SET had met on May 12 to recruit new members, resulting in several new prospective members. Craig explained that the SET has decided to form two sub groups: a Curriculum Development group and a Speakers Bureau. The Curriculum Development group would be tasked with identifying, qualifying and archiving existing standards-based curriculum that could be made readily available to regional educators and students, while the Speakers Bureau would be tasked with identifying qualified speakers to present both existing and newly created outreach products to a prioritized list of constituents. Craig also reported that the SET agreed to meet on the second Wednesday of every other month from 5:30 PM to 8 PM alternating between Vieja Valley Elementary School in Santa Barbara and the Channel Islands National Park Visitor Center in Ventura.
- **Research Group:** The SAC voted unanimously to approve a motion, offered by Bob Warner, to create a Research Activities Panel (RAP) that will serve as a working group of the Council. Bob Warner said that the RAP could function somewhat like the RAP in place at the Monterey Bay NMS, serving as a coordinating body among several research institutions. Advice and input from the RAP, Bob said, could assist the SAC as well as the CINMS Research Coordinator. Membership of the new RAP had not yet been determined, but suggestions can be sent to Bob Warner.
- **Inactive Working Groups:** SAC discussion about Working Groups that were no longer active resulted in several groups being put on "hold" (rather than completely disbanded). Groups now understood to be "inactive" include the Business Working Group, the Military Activities Working Group, and the Ad Hoc Committee on Enforcement. The status of the Ports and Harbors Working Group is still uncertain, requiring follow-up with absent members Jack Peveler and Lyn Krieger.

Public Comment

- Chris Miller provided public comment about the "Fishing for Data" program, which seeks to provide area-based sampling protocols that fishermen can employ while collecting catch. Current efforts are focused on forming a core group of urchin divers to help implement a sampling protocol, Chris said, with a small tax on fishermen going towards paying the divers for their time sampling marginal and poor fishing areas. Trap fisheries are doing something like this now, Chris said, sheephead will hopefully be next, and he would like to see other fisheries participate as well in a way that is helpful for marine reserves monitoring and compatible with other monitoring programs.
- Susan Sember, President of The Essential Image Source Foundation, a non-profit foundation aimed at developing environmental documentaries and now working on a docufeature about the Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary and Park, suggested that perhaps the now-inactive Business Working Group and the Sanctuary Education Team can work on projects that could dovetail with the film projects efforts. Susan said that she believes the film project could serve as a catalyst for the business community to get more involved, especially next year in conjunction with the CINMS 25th anniversary.

Presentation: Valuing Marine Protected Areas -- A Monitoring Protocol for Recreational Non-Consumptive Use Applied to the Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary

- Kris Herrington and Hélène Scalliet of the UCSB Donald Bren School of Environmental Science and Management provided a PowerPoint presentation on their group master's thesis project. Students looked at the recreational non-consumptive use value attributable to the sanctuary as whole, as well as the value that may be attributable to marine protected areas in particular.
- Students developed a survey tool and surveyed charter vessel passengers (only recreational non-consumptive users) to assess how travel costs might influence visitation rate. At this time they did not see much difference between the value attributed to the Sanctuary and the marine protected areas, but expect that more of a difference between these values may occur through time.
- Other interesting results of the survey included: 42% of visitors were aware of MPAs and the extra level of protection they provide; 60% of visitors thought the Sanctuary provides regulations to protect the Sanctuary from fishing.
- Based on this study the group developed recommendations for the Sanctuary:
 - use the survey protocol for ongoing monitoring since values are likely to change over time;
 - use protocol to account for seasonal variations in users;
 - utilize three survey options: travel cost survey, knowledge and perception survey, combined survey (combining both previous surveys);
 - use passenger surveys and operator questionnaires (important to stress the confidentiality of the survey data);
 - additional MPA education is needed;
 - conduct additional studies perhaps looking at impacts on businesses and the greater community, as well as surveying private boat users.

Presentation: The Marine Stewardship Council

- Jim Humphreys, Regional Director of the Americas for the Marine Stewardship Council, provided an informational presentation to the Council (slides available upon request to michael.murray@noaa.gov).
- In Jim's overview of the MSC program, he highlighted the following aspects:
 - a voluntary consumer label ("The best environmental choice in seafood") and logo used to identify sustainable fisheries products;
 - three components looking at: status of fish stocks, ecosystem impacts, effectiveness of management;
 - MSC does not certify fisheries, they develop standards and accredit independent third party certification companies that use the standards to evaluate and potentially certify a fishery;
 - A client representing the fishery is chosen through an application process and may be a partnership between organizations, or a processor (do not allow environmental NGOs to act solely as a client since MSC tries to actively engage fishermen and managers);
 - A unit of certification defines the fishery and may be the entire stock or a definable sub-part of the stock;
 - A pre-assessment (cost of \$5K to \$30K) is conducted using confidential scoping, and the pre-assessment is often used simply as a tool to influence fisheries management, e.g. to improve enforcement;
 - The pre-assessment may be followed by a full peer-reviewed assessment (cost of \$20K to \$100K) using a scientific audit (across the three components looked at) and a fishery must end up with an average score of 80 (anything between 60 and 80 becomes a condition of the certification, and below 60 it precludes certification);
 - A formal objection may be filed with the MSC HQ in London if there is disagreement with findings of an assessment;

- Cost of assessments goes to certifiers and their scientific teams, a certification is good for five years, and requires annual review;
- 203 products from certified fisheries are being sold in 17 countries;
- MSC goal is to certify 4% of the world catch.
- More information, including documents on particular MSC certified fisheries and those applying for certification, may be found at <http://www.msc.org/>.
- In response to SAC member questions, Jim commented that if there are fisheries within the National Marine Sanctuaries that might be viable candidates it would be worthwhile to consider both the logical client, and the unit of certification. He suggested that a pre-assessment could be done to see if fisheries are certifiable, and to indicate issues that need to be addressed. Jim reiterated that the audit process can have a lot of value itself by having outside specialists evaluate a fishery, and an added advantage is it's a multi-stakeholder process that brings different constituents together.
- With regard to the possibility of certifying a fishery at the Channel Islands, Jim explained that there must be a logical reason for a separate certification for only a portion of a fisheries range (e.g., a different gear, separate stock, or other special reason).

State Marine Protected Areas Report

- John Ugoretz reported that the 2nd in a series of ROV surveys was completed in and outside three CINMS marine reserves using the R/V Shearwater. Researchers are finding good deepwater habitat, and good comparisons of fish and invertebrates in and outside reserves.
- John also reported that SCUBA survey training will begin in June and surveys will start in July. This year's SCUBA surveys will be conducted statewide by contract with many outside groups.
- John mentioned that future monitoring projects include two potential lobster tagging/trapping projects: 1) a Bren School tagging study involving commercial fishermen that is a continuation of a previous Bren project; and 2) a PIER (Phleger Institute of Environmental Research) acoustic tagging and trapping project at Anacapa Island.
- With respect to state MPA enforcement, John reported that from February 2003 to February 2004 three primary Fish and Game enforcement vessels put in a total of over 3000 hours at the Channel Islands. Enforcement officers made 1500 contacts with commercial and recreational fishermen, resulting in the issuance of only one commercial and four recreational citations. Reasons cited for the high compliance record include presence of the National Park Service skiffs, Fish and Game and Sanctuary vessel presence, and Fish and Game and Sanctuary overflight presence. John acknowledged the need for outreach to non-consumptive users, but noted that from a consumptive user standpoint awareness of the MPAs is very high.

Federal Marine Reserves Environmental Review Process

- Chris Mobley provided a brief presentation on the current status and future steps of the federal marine reserves environmental review process. Chris explained that the National Marine Sanctuaries Act requires a full environmental impact statement (EIS) analysis for any changes to Sanctuary designation documents, and provided an overview of the major steps in the CINMS federal process to consider establishing marine reserves.
- Chris explained that the Sanctuary will soon be providing the Pacific Fishery Management Council (PFMC) and SAC with a preliminary working draft document for technical and policy review.
- Chris indicated that the proposed timeline includes seeking input from the PFMC through two scheduled PFMC meetings, a PFMC Ad-Hoc Marine Reserves Subcommittee meeting, two scheduled SAC meetings, and also through SAC working group meetings, by the end of September. The Sanctuary would then develop a full draft EIS based on that input.
- Matt Cahn commented that in considering how the SAC will structure its review of the preliminary working draft document, he felt in addition to the SAC developing general comments, working

groups should be free to comment from their perspectives. Chris Mobley added that Sanctuary staff are developing templates with targeted questions for the public review for the purpose of ensuring that the Sanctuary receives answers to all of its questions. Chris offered several example template questions: “Is the statement of purpose and need clear? Is range of alternatives adequate? Is there important data missing that should be considered?”

- Chris stated that he will tell the PFMC that the Sanctuary is aware the local fishing community has come up with an idea that they would like to be considered.
- The SAC discussed which working groups would comment on the preliminary document this summer:
 - Recreational and Commercial Fishing Working Groups will comment;
 - Conservation Working Group – Linda confirmed they will comment;
 - Research Activities Group – Bob Warner was not present but Dan Brumbaugh confirmed that they plan to work on it;
 - Business Working Group – to be determined;
 - Ports and Harbors – need to discuss with Jack Peveler and Lynn Krieger (who were absent);
 - Military activities – Walt Schobel indicated that they would probably not meet on this;
 - Sanctuary Education Team – to be determined.

Aquaculture

- Dr. Jim Sullivan, the aquaculture lead for the National Marine Sanctuary Program (NMSP), and Grays Reef National Marine Sanctuary Regional Projects Coordinator, provided a presentation about marine aquaculture practices, related NOAA policies, and NMSP aquaculture policy development efforts. (slides available by request to (michael.murray@noaa.gov))
- Jim began with an overview of world and domestic aquaculture, summarizing various types of aquaculture, and commonly cultured species. He indicated that the U.S. ranks 11th in aquaculture production, and third in seafood consumption. Within the U.S. approximately 30 marine species are cultured.
- Jim explained that the locally proposed Grace Mariculture Project (just outside CINMS) would be an offshore facility located within the U.S. EEZ, and explained a number of reasons for pursuing offshore aquaculture: **to avoid delicate coastal ecosystems; to avoid shallow bays and estuaries; to avoid/minimize conflicts with other ocean users; because of increased current; because of increased flushing; for healthier and less stressed fish without steroids, hormones or genetic modifications.**
 - Regarding environmental impacts of aquaculture Jim suggested chapter six of the Pew Commission Report (available online: <http://www.pewoceans.org/>) as a resource, and he highlighted a number of particular concerns: effects on marine transportation; targeting marine mammals for predator control; use of fish meal and fish oil; non-native species; drug introduction to the environment; herbicides (to control algal growth on facilities); genetically modified organisms; accumulation of waste leading to low oxygen; and new diseases and parasites. Jim also acknowledged that offshore facilities have greater flow and therefore proclaim to have fewer of these effects.
- Jim explained that the National Marine Sanctuary Program currently has effective permitting authority for marine aquaculture in about 150,000 square miles of U.S. waters. According to Jim since 12 sanctuary sites have explicit regulations against altering the seabed, and 12 sites have fairly strict discharge regulations, the National Marine Sanctuary Program would have to issue a permit for aquaculture to occur in most sanctuaries.
- Jim provided some details on the aquaculture policy that the National Marine Sanctuary Program is currently developing. Jim explained that this is an internal policy for the NMSP alone. At this point, information gathering is complete and a white paper is currently being written. In July 2004 the policy will be submitted for National Marine Sanctuary Program internal review; in August/September 2004 the policy will be submitted to partners (may invoke advisory councils) for

review. In winter 2004 the National Marine Sanctuary Program Director will be briefed; policy implementation is anticipated in 2005.

Future SAC Meeting Schedule and Agenda Topics

- Future SAC meetings: Friday, July 23, 2004
Friday, September 24, 2004
October 11-14, 2004 (1, 2 or 3 day SAC Retreat)
Friday, November 19, 2004
- Future agenda topics suggested or carried over:
 - Grace Mariculture Project
 - Platform Grace Liquid Natural Gas terminal proposals
 - Marine acoustics – possible panel discussion by a number of experts
 - Draft Management Plan – Preparing for its release; a preview of what's coming this summer
 - National MPA Center – an update on their activities
 - Federal Marine Reserves Process – presenting preliminary environmental documentation

If you have questions about the meeting highlights, contact me at 805-884-1464 or michael.murray@noaa.gov.

NOTICE: The next SAC meeting is scheduled for **Friday, June 23, 2004** in Ventura. Details to come.